



**MULTIDRUG RESISTANT TUBERCULOSIS (MDR-TB)  
IN COMMUNITY SETTING OF BANGLADESH**

**MAHFUZA RIFAT**

**MBBS, MASTERS IN HEALTH ECONOMICS**

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

At the University of Newcastle, Newcastle, Australia

**AUGUST, 2015**

## **Statement of Originality**

I, solemnly and sincerely declare, in relation to the thesis entitled Multidrug resistant tuberculosis (MDR-TB) in community settings of Bangladesh, that:

The thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to the final version of my thesis being made available worldwide when deposited in the University's Digital Repository.

**Mahfuza Rifat**

**Date:**

## **Acknowledgement**

I wish to thank a number of people who were part of my PhD journey.

I am grateful to my supervisors; their support means a lot to me to complete my study.

My Principal supervisor Milton Hasnat was very supportive throughout my PhD. He guided me to accomplish the challenging works. I am very grateful to John Hall, who provided valuable inputs and encouragement, always. I am also thankful to Christopher Oldmeadow for his guidance.

My PhD was supported by the Australian Leadership Award scholarship, and I am grateful to Australian Government for this Leadership development initiative under the Australian Award programme.

I am grateful to BRAC, a non-government organization with extensive experience in tuberculosis control in Bangladesh. I have received intense support from BRAC in collecting such a big number of data from all over the country. Thanks to all my BRAC colleagues for supporting my field work in Bangladesh including Md. Akramul Islam from BRAC. I have also received encouragement from Jalaluddin Ahmed, Faruque Ahmed, Kawsar Afsana and Ahmed Mushtaque Raza Chowdhury of BRAC. The national tuberculosis control programmes, other partner NGOs in Bangladesh were very supportive during my field works; I am pleased to acknowledge the organizations. I am also thankful to the colleagues from WHO for providing me current updates. Thanks to CHAD, another non-government organization in Bangladesh to facilitate field works.

I am thankful to my parents, mother Syeda Zinat Ara Khanam, brother and sisters, and uncle Syed Abul Mokarrum, for encouraging me, although they were staying far away.

## **List of publications and papers contributing to this thesis**

### **Paper published**

1. **Rifat M**, Milton AH, Hall J, Oldmeadow C, Islam MA, Husain A, Akhanda MW, Siddiquea BN: Development of multidrug resistant tuberculosis in Bangladesh: a case-control study on risk factors. PLoS One 2014, 9(8):e105214.
2. **Rifat M**, Hall J, Oldmeadow C, Husain A, Hinderaker SG, Milton AH: Factors related to previous tuberculosis treatment of Multidrug resistant Tuberculosis patients in Bangladesh. BMJ Open 5(9) · September 2015.
3. **Rifat M**, Rusen ID, Islam MA, Enarson DA, Ahmed F, Ahmed SM, Karim F: Why are tuberculosis patients not treated earlier? A study of informal health practitioners in Bangladesh. International Journal of Tuberculosis & Lung Disease 2011, 15(5):647-651.
4. **Rifat M**, Hall J, Oldmeadow C, Husain A, Milton AH: Health system delays in treatment of Multidrug resistant tuberculosis patients in Bangladesh. BMC Infectious Diseases 15(1):526 · November 2015.

**Copies of the four published papers are provided in Appendix A, B, C and D**

## **Statement of Authorship (thesis by publication)**

I hereby certify that this thesis is in the form of a series of published papers of which I am a joint author. I have included as part of the thesis a written statement from each co-author, endorsed by the Faculty Assistant Dean (Research Training), attesting to my contribution to the joint publications.

Statement of the co-authors' with the endorsement by the Assistant Dean (Research Training), are provided in Appendix E

**Mahfuza Rifat**

**Date:**

## Candidate's Contributions to the Study

Activities	Primary role	Others involved
Overall study	MR, AHM, JH, CO	MAI, BNS
Ethics application to the University of Newcastle and Government of Bangladesh	MR, AHM, JH	BNS
Study design	MR, AHM, JH	MAI, IR
Logistic procurement	MR, AHM	
Staff recruitment and training	MR, AHM, BNS	BRAC
Development of questionnaire	MR, AHM, JH	
Pretesting of the questionnaire	MR, BNS	
Recruitment of the study participants	MR, BNS	BRAC
Data collection	BRAC	
Supervision of field work	MR, MWA, BNS	CHAD
Data entry screen design, data entry	MR	BRAC
Data cleaning and editing	MR, CO	
Data analysis	MR, CO	
Scientific write-up and publication	MR, AHM, JH, CO	SGH, SMA, FK, FA, IR, MAH, DA

\* MR: Mahfuza Rifat; AHM: Abul Hasnat Milton; JH: John Hall; CO: Christopher Oldmeadow; MAI: Md. Akramul Islam; FA: Faruque Ahmed; SMA: Syed Masud Ahmed; BNS: Bodrun Naher Siddiquea; FK: Fazlul Karim; MAH: Md. Ashaque Husain; MWA: Md. Wahiduzzaman Akhanda; SGH: Sven Gudmund Hinderaker; IR: I.D. Rusen; DA: Donald A Enarson.

## **List of abstracts for conference presentation**

1. Characteristics of MDR-TB patients in Bangladesh

**Rifat M**, Hall J, Hasnat MA, Islam MA, Siddiquea B, Akhanda MW, Husain A.

Published in the Abstract book of 44th World Conference on Lung Health of International Union against Tuberculosis and Lung Diseases. Volume 17, Number 12, December 2013, Supplement 2.

2. Previous TB treatment in MDR-TB patients in Bangladesh and health system factors

**Rifat M**, Hall J, Hasnat MA, Islam MA, Siddiquea B.

Published in the Abstract book of 44th World Conference on Lung Health of International Union against Tuberculosis and Lung Diseases. Volume 17, Number 12, December 2013, Supplement 2.

3. Delay in treatment of Multidrug resistant tuberculosis (MDR-TB) patients in Bangladesh.

**Rifat M**, Milton AH, Hall J, Oldmeadow C, Husain A.

Published in the abstract book of the Asian Pacific Region Conference of IUTALD (The Union) to be held from August 31 to September 2, 2015.

### **Other published abstract**

1. Community Based Management of Multidrug Resistance TB in Bangladesh

**Rifat M**, Alam J, Rana M, Husain A, Islam A, Sultana S, Akandha W, Siddiqui M, Hall J, Milton AH.

Published in the Abstract book of 4th Asia Pacific Region Conference of the International Union against Tuberculosis and Lung Diseases. Hanoi, Vietnam. April, 2013. The poster was awarded as the best poster presentation award of the conference.

Copies of the 4 abstracts are presented in Appendix F.

## Glossary

AFB	Acid-fast bacilli
AIDS	Acquired immunodeficiency syndrome
ART	Antiretroviral therapy
BCG	Bacille-Calmette-Guérin; vaccine for tuberculosis
BMRC	Bangladesh Medical Research Council
DOT	Directly-observed therapy
DOTS	Directly observed treatment strategy; core approach of the Stop TB strategy for TB control
DRS	Drug resistant surveillance
DR-TB	Drug-resistant tuberculosis
DST	Drug-susceptibility testing
EQA	External quality assurance
FNAC	Fine needle aspiration biopsy
HIV	Human Immuno-deficiency virus
HREC	Human research ethics committee
IUTLD	International Union against Tuberculosis and Lung Diseases (The Union)
LPA	Line-probe assay
MDG	Millennium Development Goal
MDR-TB	Multidrug-resistant tuberculosis, defined as resistance to at least isoniazid and rifampicin, the two most powerful anti-TB drugs
NGO	Non-government organization
NTP	National tuberculosis control programme
PCR	Polymerase chain reaction
PMDT	Programmatic Management of Drug resistant tuberculosis
RR-TB	Rifampicin-resistant tuberculosis



TB	Tuberculosis
WHO	World Health Organization
XDR-TB	Extensively drug-resistant tuberculosis, defined as MDR-TB plus resistance to at least one fluoroquinolone and a second-line injectable
Xpert MTB/ RIF	An automated, cartridge-based nucleic amplification assay for the simultaneous detection of TB and rifampicin resistance

# Table of Contents

Statement of Originality .....	i
Acknowledgement .....	ii
List of publications and papers contributing to this thesis .....	iii
Statement of Authorship (thesis by publication) .....	iv
Candidate's Contributions to the Study.....	v
List of abstracts for conference presentation.....	vi
Glossary.....	vii
Table of Contents .....	ix
List of Tables .....	xii
List of Figures.....	xiii
List of Appendices .....	xiv
Abstract.....	1
Structure of the thesis .....	3
Chapter 1 Overview of Multidrug resistant tuberculosis .....	5
1.1.    Introduction .....	5
1.2 Literature Review .....	8
1.2.1 Search strategy.....	8
1.2.2 General information about Tuberculosis .....	8
1.2.3 Global Tuberculosis Scenario.....	9
1.2.4 Global response to tuberculosis including multidrug-resistant tuberculosis.....	10
1.2.5 Management approach of Tuberculosis in Bangladesh .....	13
1.2.6 Tuberculosis scenario in Bangladesh.....	15
1.2.7 Risk factors for MDR-TB .....	17
1.2.8 Delay in tuberculosis treatment .....	26
1.3 Rationale .....	27
1.4 Research Questions.....	28
1.5 Objectives .....	28
1.6 Ethics approval .....	28
1.7 Limitation .....	29
Chapter 2 Development of multidrug resistant tuberculosis in Bangladesh: A case-control study on risk factors .....	30
2.1 Abstract.....	30
2.2 Introduction.....	31

2.3 Methods .....	33
2.3.1. Ethics considerations .....	33
2.3.2 Study population and design.....	34
2.3.3 Data collection.....	35
2.3.4 Statistical analysis .....	36
2.4 Results.....	37
2.4.1 Socio-demographic and clinical characteristics.....	37
2.4.2 Risk factors for MDR-TB.....	37
2.5 Discussion.....	43
2.6 Conclusion .....	46
<b>Chapter 3 Factors related to previous tuberculosis treatment of Multidrug resistant Tuberculosis patients in Bangladesh .....</b>	<b>47</b>
3.1 Abstract.....	47
3.2 Introduction.....	48
3.3 Methods .....	50
3.3.1 Data collection.....	51
3.3.2 Statistical analysis .....	52
3.3.3 Ethics considerations .....	53
3.4 Results.....	54
3.4.1 Logistic regression analysis.....	59
3.5 Discussion.....	61
3.6 Conclusion .....	66
<b>Chapter 4 Why are tuberculosis patients not treated earlier? A study of informal health practitioners in Bangladesh.....</b>	<b>68</b>
4.1 Summary .....	68
4.2 Introduction.....	69
4.3 Methods .....	69
4.3.1 Design.....	69
4.3.2 Background .....	70
4.3.3 Study Population .....	70
4.3.4 Data sources, data collection and variables .....	71
4.3.5 Data Analysis .....	72
4.3.6 Ethical considerations.....	73
4.4 Results.....	73
4.5 Discussion.....	78
<b>Chapter 5 Health system delays in treatment of Multidrug resistant tuberculosis patients in Bangladesh.....</b>	<b>81</b>
5.1 Abstract.....	81
5.2 Background.....	82
5.3 Methods .....	84
5.3.1 Study population and setting .....	84
5.3.2 Data collection and definitions .....	86

5.3.3 Statistical analysis .....	88
5.3.4 Limitation of the study .....	88
5.3.5 Ethics considerations .....	88
5.4 Results.....	89
5.5 Discussion.....	93
5.6 Conclusion .....	96
<b>Chapter 6 Conclusion and recommendations .....</b>	<b>97</b>
<b>References .....</b>	<b>101</b>

## List of Tables

Table 1.1 Current estimates of Tuberculosis in Bangladesh.....	17
Table 2.1 Socio-demographic and clinical characteristics of the study participants .....	39
Table 2.2 Univariate logistic regression analysis on factors related to multidrug resistant tuberculosis (MDR-TB). ....	41
Table 2.3 Multivariable analysis on factors related to multidrug resistant tuberculosis (MDR-TB) .....	42
Table 3.1 Demographic and clinical characteristics of previously treated tuberculosis patients	55
Table 3.2 Incomplete treatment and the reasons reported by previously treated tuberculosis patients .....	56
Table 3.3 Health system related characteristics of previously treated tuberculosis patients .....	58
Table 3.4 Univariate and multivariable analyses on multidrug resistant tuberculosis status and previous treatment related factors .....	60
Table 4.1 Socio-demographic characteristics of patients under the study .....	73
Table 4.2 Prolonged delays (total, patient and health system delays) comparing the first visits to informal providers and those to qualified and practitioners <sup>a</sup> .....	76
Table 4.3 Results of logistic regression analysis: Prolong delays (total, health system and patient delay) in tuberculosis treatment among patients in Bangladesh with by sex, place of residence and type of first practitioner consulted <sup>a</sup> .....	77
Table 5.1 Socio-demographic and clinical characteristics of the multidrug resistant tuberculosis (MDR-TB) patients in Bangladesh .....	90
Table 5.2 Delays in treatment among the multidrug resistant tuberculosis (MDR-TB) patients of Bangladesh (n=207) .....	91
Table 5.3 Factors related to health system delay of multidrug resistant tuberculosis (MDR-TB) patients of Bangladesh .....	92

## List of Figures

Figure 1.1 Goals, targets and indicators for tuberculosis (TB) control	12
Figure 1.2 A model of tuberculosis epidemiology following the pathogenesis of tuberculosis.	18
Figure 1.3 Two pathways leading to drug resistance tuberculosis	19
Figure 4.1 Definition of key outcome variables	72
Figure 4.2 Total delay in starting tuberculosis treatment by status of health practitioners in selected areas of Bangladesh.	75
Figure 4.3 Tuberculosis patient delay in in selected area of Bangladesh by first visit to health practitioners.	75
Figure 5.1 Definition of delays used in this study	87

## **List of Appendices**

- Appendix A    Development of multidrug resistant tuberculosis in Bangladesh: A case-control study on risk factors
- Appendix B    Factors related to previous tuberculosis treatment of Multidrug resistant Tuberculosis patients in Bangladesh.
- Appendix C    Why are tuberculosis patients not treated earlier? A study of informal health practitioners in Bangladesh
- Appendix D    Health system delays in treatment of Multidrug resistant tuberculosis patients in Bangladesh.
- Appendix E    Co-author's statement
- Appendix F    Published Abstracts on conference presentation
- Appendix G    Information Statement, Consent Form, and Questionnaire (English)
- Appendix H    Information Statement, Consent Form, and Questionnaire (Bangla)
- Appendix I    Ethics approval

## **Abstract**

**Background:** Bangladesh is one of the high burden countries for tuberculosis (TB) as well as for multi-drug resistant tuberculosis (MDR-TB). Research projects presented in this thesis addressed the following areas: risk factors for development of MDR-TB; factors related to previous tuberculosis treatment of MDR-TB patients; delays in treatment of drug sensitive tuberculosis patients; and the health system delay in the treatment of MDR-TB patients, in Bangladesh.

**Method:** This thesis by publication consists of four papers. A case control study of 250 MDR-TB patients as cases and 750 drug sensitive TB patients as controls was conducted to determine the risk factors of MDR-TB in Bangladesh. A total 293 patients of the same dataset, who had history of previous tuberculosis treatment, were included in the second study to identify the factors related to previous tuberculosis treatment. MDR-TB patients who were diagnosed using the rapid diagnostic tests (n=207), were included in our fourth study, to determine the health system delay in MDR-TB treatment. We had conducted another cross sectional study (n=7280) to determine the delay in drug sensitive TB patient which has also been included in this thesis.

**Key findings:** Our first study suggests that previous tuberculosis treatment is the major contributing factor to MDR-TB (OR 716.6, 95% CI 282.1–1820.8). Other factors found to be associated with MDR-TB are age group “18-25” (OR 1.8, CI 1.1-2.9) and “26-45” (OR 1.7, CI 1.1-2.7), compared to the age-group “>45 years”; patient’s education up to secondary level (OR 1.9, CI 1.32.8), as opposed to the “no education” group; service and business as occupation (OR 2.9, CI 1.3-6.4; OR 3.7, CI 1.6-8.7, respectively); smoking history (OR 1.6, CI 0.99-2.5); and type 2 diabetes (OR 2.6 CI 1.5-4.3).



Incomplete treatment (4.3; 95% CI 1.7-10.6), hospitalization for tuberculosis treatment (OR 16.9; CI 1.8-156.2), and adverse reaction (OR 8.2; 95% CI 3.2-20.7), are the factors related to previous tuberculosis treatment most likely to result in MDR-TB.

Drug sensitive TB patients, who are seeking care from informal practitioners access care more promptly, but experience prolonged delay in initiating treatment, compared to those visiting qualified practitioners ( $p < 0.05$ ). Health system delay (time between visiting a provider and start of treatment) of MDR-TB patient was associated with the visit to private practitioners for first consultation, compared to visiting a DOTS centre (mean difference (days): 37.7; 95%; CI 15.0-60.4.1;  $p$  0.003). Introduction of rapid diagnostic methods for MDR-TB has reduced the diagnosis time although some degree of delay was present in treatment initiation (median 5 and 10 days, respectively).

Conclusion and recommendation: National Tuberculosis programmes should address identified risk factors in MDR-TB control strategy including previous tuberculosis treatment. Socio-demographic groups such as specific age-groups and people with some levels of education, who were associated with development of MDR-TB, could be addressed by the national TB control programme, through effective communication approach in preventing drug resistance. The integration of MDR-TB control activities with diabetes and tobacco control; engaging the private practitioners in MDR-TB control; and continued involvement of informal practitioners for early referral for diagnosis and treatment of TB, are needed in Bangladesh.

## Structure of the thesis

This thesis by publication is composed of background, objectives, brief literature review, four papers, and a final chapter providing a conclusion and recommendations. At the time of submission, two papers have been published, one has been accepted for publication and one paper has been submitted to peer reviewed journal.

Chapter 1 provides an overview of multidrug resistant tuberculosis, a brief literature review of multidrug resistant tuberculosis, associated risk factors and delay in treatment of tuberculosis patients including the multidrug resistant tuberculosis. It also describes the rationale for studying risk factors of multidrug resistant tuberculosis and the delay in tuberculosis treatment in Bangladesh; presents research questions, objectives, and a statement regarding ethical approval.

Chapter 2 (Paper 1), presents a case control study on risk factors for multidrug resistant tuberculosis in Bangladesh. The title of the paper is “Development of multidrug resistant tuberculosis in Bangladesh: a case-control study on risk factors”, have been published in *PLoS One*.

Chapter 3 (Paper 2), focuses on previously treated tuberculosis patients in Bangladesh. The resulting manuscript titled “Factors related to previous tuberculosis treatment of multidrug resistant tuberculosis patients in Bangladesh” was published in *BMJ Open*.

Chapter 4 (Paper 3), reports a study on treatment delay among drug-sensitive tuberculosis patients in Bangladesh, focusing on the role of informal health practitioners. The title of the paper is “Why are tuberculosis patients not treated earlier? A study of informal health practitioners in Bangladesh” has been published in the International Journal on Tuberculosis and Lung Diseases (*IJTL*D) journal.

Chapter 5 (Paper 4), explores the health system delay in treatment of multidrug resistant tuberculosis in Bangladesh. The study titled “Health System delay in treatment of

Multidrug resistant tuberculosis patients in Bangladesh” was published in *BMC Infectious diseases* journal.

Chapter 6 provides a conclusion and recommendations.